



Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee
January 24, 2008

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:06 p.m.

Members Present: Terry Majewski, Kathy Nabours, Sharon Chadwick, Gal Witmer,
Patsy Waterfall

Staff Present: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Bill O'Malley, Marty McCune, Howard Dutt,
George Parker, Lucy Amparano, Jesse Soto

2. Historic Central Core (HCC):

HCC 08-01 Ornelia-Demolition; 841 West Franklin Street (Menlo Park National Register District)

Presentation by Ronnie Romero, representing the property owner, Joe Ornelia, on the proposed demolition of an existing contributing historic property located in the Menlo Park National Register Historic District. The residence is in total disrepair and according to the documentation submitted by Mr. Romero, it appears that the cost of rehabilitation far exceeds the cost of demolition and new construction. Mr. Romero presented a certified engineers report stating the "total cost of rebuilding" the residence including demolition is approximately \$130,000.00. Commissioners requested additional information related to the mud adobe construction and asked the applicant to return with cost estimates for rehabilitating the existing adobe structure. Mr. Romero agreed to provide the information for commissioner's consideration and will return at a later date.

HCC 08-02 Romero-Demolition; 149 South Grande Avenue (Menlo Park National Register District)

Presentation by Bill O'Malley, City of Tucson, Rio Nuevo Downtown Development, on the proposed demolition of an existing contributing historic property located in the Menlo Park National Register Historic District. The demolition is requested to accommodate the proposed "roundabout" (traffic mitigation configuration) for this intersection. A new two-story single-family dwelling will be constructed on the property if demolition is approved. Discussion on the condition of the residence and the positive impact of the "roundabout" on the neighborhood.

Motion by Patsy Waterfall to recommend approval of the demolition as proposed.

Seconded by Gal Witmer.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

3. Regular Cases:

HPZ 06-58 Witmer-New Construction (Garage/Second Dwelling); 320 East Speedway Boulevard (Revised Plan) (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Jim Witmer, property owner, on revisions to an approved plan located in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. Gal Witmer, commissioner, excused herself from the presentation, discussion and recommendation on these revisions. Discussion on removing the second story from this detached garage/dwelling and providing an attached awning on the garage entryway. The footprint of the structure will remain the same.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval of the proposed revised plan as presented.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Gal Witmer did not vote. Chair Majewski did vote.

HPZ 07-47 Rodgers-Façade Improvement; 601 East 6th Street (West University Historic Preservation Zone) (Zoning Violation)

Richard Rodgers, property owner, presented a picture of the building that indicates there was existing fenestration on the west elevation of the building. Mr. Rodgers stressed his extensive historic rehabilitation experience with other structures throughout the downtown area. He received a civil citation from City of Tucson Department of Neighborhood Resources for making an improvement on the west elevation (installation of anodized aluminum door and windows) without completing the required historic preservation zone review/approval process. The property owner agreed to return to a future meeting with pictures specifically showing the improvement installed on the west elevation so commissioners can make a recommendation.

.....

HPZ 07-50 Stebe-Addition; 229 South Herbert Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by the property owner, Chris Stebe, on the construction of a new addition attached to the rear of an existing single-family dwelling. Discussion on proposed windows on the east elevation. The proposed windows are wood "awning" type that open outward. Commissioners requested the meeting minutes from the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board be read into the record recommending approval for this case. .

Motion by Sharon Chadwick to recommend approval as proposed.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

HPZ 08-01 Morden-Addition to Second Dwelling (Garage/Storage); 530 South 5th Avenue
(Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Gary Kautto, designer, representing the property owner, on the proposed construction of a garage/storage area attached to an existing second dwelling in the rear yard of a single-family dwelling. Discussion on the appearance of the new construction including finishes and paint and the recommendation that the windows on the garage door be removed. Mr. Kautto is requesting the building setbacks be waived in this case and demonstrated through photographs that other structures in this development zone are built close to or on the property lines. Commissioners requested the meeting minutes from the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board be read into the record recommending approval for this case.

Motion by Patsy Waterfall to recommend approval of this proposal with the condition that the windows on the two-car garage door be removed and building setbacks be waived.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously.

HPZ 08-02 Brown-New Second Dwelling; 817 South 3rd Avenue (Armory Park Historic
Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Sam Brown, property owner, on the construction of a new second dwelling unit in the rear yard of a single-family dwelling. Discussion on the appearance including windows, door, finishes and paint. Mr. Brown is requesting the building setback be waived in this case as there are other structures in this development zone built close to or on the property line as demonstrated by an aerial photograph. Commissioners requested the meeting minutes from the Armory Park Historic preservation Zone Advisory Board be read into the record recommending approval for this case.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval of this proposal as presented with the condition that the building setbacks be waived.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

4. Courtesy Reviews:

Center for the Performing Arts-Repair; 408 South 6th Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation
Zone)

Presentation by Corky Poster, architect, on the general repair of the building that affects the exterior appearance of this former church building proposed as an adaptive reuse for the performing arts.

This repair proposal is for the installation of a concrete grade bond beam for the interior arches located in the basement. This improvement will not affect the exterior course of masonry. A structural diaphragm will be installed on the first floor that also will not affect the exterior appearance. There will be some replacement of metal roof tiles to be painted red and a pressurized epoxy repair of exterior cracks to prevent any further damage. Mr. Poster stated that he will return with a formal submittal in the future when bond money becomes available for the replacement of approximately 500 square feet of metal roof tile and any other additional rehabilitation proposals that affect the exterior appearance. The meeting minutes of the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board regarding this repair proposal were read into the record.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval of this repair as presented.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

The Historic Depot-Amtrak Kiosk (Lobby); 400 North Toole Avenue (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

This proposal is for the installation of an automatic ticketing kiosk located inside the lobby of The Historic Depot. Both options for electric power cabling were considered by the commissioners and Option #2 was selected as this was less obtrusive than Option #1.

Motion by Patsy Waterfall to recommend approval of Option #2 for the installation of the Amtrak ticketing kiosk located in the lobby of The Historic Depot.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

- a. Minor Reviews: HPZ 07-52 Gowrisankaran-Doors/Window Security; 950 North 6th Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone)
HPZ 08-03 Massino-Windows/Mechanical/Roof/Paint; 1015 North 5th Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone)
- b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to the Department of Neighborhood Resources and if a violation is confirmed, the property owner is referred to Development Services Department for historic preservation zone review/approval in order to abate the violation.
- d. Historic Preservation Zone Ordinance Revision: No report at this time.

6. Call to the Audience:

Howard A. Greenseth from the Tucson Citizen addressed the commissioners and stated his opposition to the proposed location of "Maynards' Market & Eatery" inside The Historic Depot. Mr. Greenseth claims that so much time and effort was put into the rehabilitation of the structure, both interior and exterior, that the removal of the old ticket window should not be sacrificed for a commercial enterprise that may fail. Mr. Gene Caywood seconded Mr. Greenseth's concerns. Chair Majewski said she would take both concerns under advisement.

Nadine Rund, Chair, Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board, stated that the board is reaching out to neighbors within the boundaries of the district so they are informed of the historic review/approval process with the city prior to making any exterior changes to their properties. The Tucson Association of Realtors has agreed to place a notice in their weekly newsletter informing property owners of the review/approval process.

7. Meeting adjourned at 2:44 p.m.